

*Draft Action/Summary Minutes*  
**City of Sedona**  
**Historic Preservation Commission Special Meeting**  
**Vultee Conference Room, Sedona City Hall, Sedona, AZ**  
**Friday, January 22, 2010 – 4:00 pm**

**1. Verification of notice, call to order, roll call and Pledge of Allegiance.**

Chairman Unger called the meeting to order at 4:01 p.m.

**Roll Call:**

**Commissioners:** Chairman Brynn Unger, Vice Chairman Greg Ruland and Commissioners Richard Mayer - excused, James Sears, Helen Snyder and Noreen Wienges.

**Staff:** Kathy Levin

**Council Liaison:** Councilor DiNunzio

**2. Public forum for items not on agenda. Limit of 3 minutes per presentation. (Note that the Commission may not discuss or make any decisions on any matter brought forward by a member of the public).**

*The Chairman opened the public forum and having no requests to speak , closed the public forum.*

**3. Discussion/possible action on proposed revisions to Certificate of Appropriateness 09-02 for the Walter and Ruth Jordan Packing Shed (“Barn”) issued on April 20, 2009 regarding the exterior materials on the shed addition to the Barn.**

Kathy Levin explained that the Certificate of Appropriateness was issued at a public hearing for the addition of the new shed and the remodeling of the existing shed on the west side of the barn on April 20, 2010, and the Commission approved rough-sawn timber for the exterior siding material to resemble the tractor shed. In December of 2009, staff and the Chairman were informed by another party that Hardie board was going to be used for the siding, and on January 6, 2010, the staff liaison, the Chairman and Andi Welsh did a site visit to confirm the conditions. We spoke with Jim Eaton, who is here today, and advised him to stop work until HPC could review the matter. On that same day, she emailed photographs and the background to Bob Frankeberger, State Architect with the State Historic Preservation Office, requesting his consultation on the use of Hardie board.

The Commission met on January 11, 2010, and as Councilor DiNunzio mentioned at the Council meeting, you had a lengthy and lively meeting. The Commission decided that because we had not heard from SHPO, it would be best to defer a decision until we had an opinion and more time to synthesize what we had heard and work with the applicant, so that decision was deferred until this special meeting today.

Kathy indicated that she heard from Bob Frankeberger on the 13th and he endorsed the use of Hardie board for the shed addition; he sees it as a suitable and durable choice. He remarked that the shed addition is offset, which makes it distinguishable from the original, and they will be using different materials. The applicant has returned again today and we appreciate that, so we are bringing back today their revisions for the Certificate of Appropriateness.

The Chairman indicated that she called her son who does a lot of historic preservation work, and he mentioned that they do use it in Key West and that Hardie board is nationally used; however, he did

say that you really need to nail it down about every 6 inches in a square pattern and use Bondo to fill the holes, because that is the best thing they have found to protect that material. It is now up to the Commission to discuss how we would like to proceed.

**SUMMARY DISCUSSION:**

Commissioner Helen Snyder indicated that it is good that we heard it is acceptable, that seems to solve the problem about the material. She understands the concern about the protocol, but she would vote to approve.

Commissioner Sears indicated that it sounds like the Commission has done a lot of research in order to make sure this is an acceptable product, and he would vote in favor of it as well.

Commissioner Wienges explained that after the lengthy discussion in the last meeting, her only question was if this was nationally acceptable, and if you tell her it is, then she is in favor of it.

Vice Chairman Ruland indicated that he felt the same as Commissioner Wienges; the Chairman indicated she felt that way too. She is still a little upset that it came to us in this fashion and she believes we all are, because the Commission's concern is that we not have that as a common practice. She would assume that if this were to ever happen again, we would be going through the same kind of procedure to make sure we were assured of the fact that it was acceptable, and hopefully, we will not have this happen in the future. The Commission did have a couple of questions that we need a little more clarification on, so she would like for the applicant to comment.

**Applicant, Jim Eaton, Sedona Historical Society and Project Supervisor, Sedona, AZ:** Indicated that he is embarrassed that he neglected to bring this to the Commission's attention in the proper manner, and he is sorry that he had to get you out for a special meeting on a nice day like this. He didn't really feel it was going to be an issue, since this is not really a change to an historic building; it is an addition to an historic building, and with that in mind, he just forgot to bring it to the Commission's attention.

Chairman Unger thanked Mr. Eaton for his honesty and indicated that the Commission wanted to ensure that all of the "i's" have been dotted and all of the "t's" have been crossed. First, we would like to know how wide will the battens be. Jim Eaton indicated they are 1 x 3. The Chairman then asked what the spacing will be, and Jim indicated it will be 24 inch on center. Kathy asked if the batten would be vertical and Jim stated yes. Chairman Unger indicated that the other item is the color and she circulated the sample provided; she thought it might be a bit dark and fade a bit. Jim indicated that it does tend to lighten in time. Chairman Unger noted that it doesn't match the reds in the red rock, but that probably is better than trying to do that, because she would be afraid of going in that direction, since once it starts to lighten, it tends to go pink and gets odd. Jim stated that it would not have been appropriate to try that, so they had to go lighter or darker, and to him, the obvious was darker.

The Chairman pointed out that generally board and batten is a lot less distance apart, probably 12 inch on center, and she didn't know if he had considered that. KSB's board and batten is probably 12 inch on center. Jim indicated he had considered about 16 inch on center, but it really didn't make that much difference; however, they could still do it 16 on center. The Chairman indicated she would prefer that, because 24 is getting a fair distance, and most of the original materials would have been 12 or maybe 16 inches wide, so she would prefer 16 rather than 24. Commissioner Helen Snyder indicated that sounded reasonable for the look of it. Chairman Unger added that 24 is more of a dimension that we currently use; whereas, the size of the materials for the era we are

looking at would have been narrower. Jim Eaton indicated he just happens to have enough battens to do 16; he had plans for the leftovers, but there won't be any or very few.

Kathy indicated that she would read the proposed motion, and then the Commission can discuss it. Kathy read the following proposed motion: *"I move to approve revisions to the Certificate of Appropriateness approved on April 20, 2009, for the new shed addition and existing shed on the Barn (Historic Register No. 02) at Jordan Historical Park as follows: the exterior siding material will be Hardie board with 1 x 3 vertical white pine wood batten, spaced 16 inches on center. The Hardie board and batten will be painted 'Earthly Elements' by Valspar."*

***MOTION: Vice Chairman Ruland so moved. Commissioner Wienges seconded the motion. VOTE: Motion carried unanimously, five (5) for and zero (0) opposed. (Mayer excused)***

Chairman Unger commented that the Commission isn't in the business of trying to find the most expensive materials, and she is glad that this is a material that we now can accept, because it makes it easier for people to make the improvements or additions needed. Additionally, she wanted to say that Jim did a wonderful job in writing all of this material and we appreciate that. Without this, it would be easy to find ourselves in positions where the buildings we treasure aren't being kept up to standard, so thank you for developing that standard.

Jim indicated that he feels this hasn't damaged the Commission's standards at all, and for the record, the correct name of the material is HardiePanel Vertical Siding. Hardie is the brand name and James Hardie was the inventor.

#### **4. Adjournment.**

***MOTION: Vice Chairman Ruland moved to adjourn. Commissioner Wienges seconded the motion. VOTE: Motion carried unanimously five (5) for and zero (0) opposed. (Mayer excused)***

The meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

I certify that the above is a true and correct summary of the special meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held on January 22, 2010.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Donna A. S. Puckett, *Recording Secretary*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date